Review of Factors Affecting Non-Deceptive Consumers of Counterfeited Products in Different Regions across Sectors

* Moustafa Al Atat

Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Business Administration, Beirut Arab University, Beirut, Lebanon

Received 7 September 2020, Accepted 4 October 2020

ABSTRACT:
The greed exuded by counterfeiters has essentially propelled them to attack multiple industries. Counterfeiters do not stop at illegal trade reproduction and duplicate luxury products based on consumer demands (Non-Deceptive consumers), but they have also skillfully learned to deceive consumers in various product categories by selling them counterfeit products as authentic products (Deceptive consumers). In this case, what poses the greatest risk are products such as drugs, food supplements, cosmetic, and car parts which are carelessly counterfeited to satisfy this niche. These products pose extreme health implications to those who purchase them.

This study focuses primarily on combating counterfeited products by generating Non-deceptive consumer’s awareness to decrease their intentions towards counterfeit products. In the literature part, the researcher collected multiple previous studies in regard to factors that encourage non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products. From these studies, the researcher concluded the common and dominant factors which impact non-deceptive consumers within different regions, and various product categories were derived. These include the following factors: person demographic and psychographic, lack of consumer awareness, market influence, social influence, word of mouth, perceived risks, materialism and brand, ethics, key product factors, price-consciousness, and purchase experience.

Finally, the researcher suggested many managerial and organizational implications in combating counterfeit products.

Keywords: Counterfeit products; Consumer behaviors; Non-Deceptive consumers; Deceptive consumers

INTRODUCTION

Essentially, organizations develop their management strategies based on their interests in implementing proactive decisions to protect themselves from both internal and external threats. However, consumers in markets are always subjected to various forms of peril which have proven to pose a threat to their health, as well as resulting in them falling victim to purchasing counterfeiting products.

Counterfeited products play a fundamental role within both the business sphere as well as influencing consumer behavior. Not only have they toxically infiltrated our lives, but also within an array of productive markets in both developed and developing countries (Counterfeiting Intelligence Bureau, 2019; Khalid and Rahman, 2015). However, a vast market for this illegal trade is particularly dominant within rural regions due to its being densely populated as well as the low literacy rate which typically prevails within these areas. This is the case for those who reside
The process of counterfeiting products is by no means a trend nor is it a recent phenomenon, rather it’s an ancient illicit trade which dates back almost 2000 years ago and began with the Roman coin Pliny (Chaudhry and Stumpf, 2011). Nowadays, counterfeitors have the logistical capabilities to duplicate and produce products that are close to being carbon copies of the authentic product. Fundamentally, the attributes of a counterfeited product are characterized by utilizing the same name, shape, logo, design, and general aesthetic. The whole practice revolves around the infringement and pirating of the original brand. Counterfeit products produce with the intention of taking advantage of the superior value of the authentic product (Chacharkar, 2013). In fact, it has been noted that it is hard for the owner of the brand to differentiate between his/her genuine product and the counterfeit (Agarwal and Panwar, 2016; Gentry, Putrevu and Shultz, 2006). This is what is referred to as a “true counterfeit” (Macharia, 2014). Through technologies, counterfeiters increased their production power which enables them to enter many industries. Usually, famous brands are subjected to counterfeiting (Bian and Moutinho, 2011) and all products can be potentially counterfeited (Singh and Kumar, 2017). Counterfeiting does not just revolve around the duplication of products in order to profit at someone else’s expense. The negative impact of counterfeiting products permeates a multitude of levels, these are primarily compromised of decreasing the returns for the company, increasing costs due to investment in new research methods to face counterfeiting, paying lawyers, losing customers and markets, reduction in brand loyalty, the bad reputation of the brand, decreasing motivation towards innovation, threats business sustainability and reduced employment opportunities (Lee and Yoo, 2005).

Grossman and Shapiro (1986) classify the consumers which have been subject to counterfeiting under two sub-categories; “non-Deceptive Consumers” and “Deceptive Consumers”.

This study focuses on Non-Deceptive Consumers to study the factors that increase their intentions to buy counterfeit products. Consumers which consciously purchase counterfeited products. They recognize that the products they have purchased are not authentic. In this case, they are not cheated on by counterfeitors. The products that non- deceptive consumers usually invest in are those that pose no harm to human health (Nia and Zaichkowsky, 2000).

Up to half of the respondents would knowingly buy counterfeiting goods when available (Phau, Prendergast and Chuen, 2001; Swami, Chamorro-Premuzic and Furnham, 2009). On the other hand, Ritson (2007) argued that a third of consumers end up purchasing the original product due to the poor quality of the counterfeited alternative. Within the literature review, there are arrays of studies which focus on identifying and testing factors which influence non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeited products as well a further investigation of consumer’s motive for the purchase of the counterfeited product.

**Literature Review**

**Consumers and Counterfeit Products**

There is a magnitude of characteristics and circumstances that help foster and strengthen this illegal trade across different countries as well as its potency to infiltrate various product categories.

The law of supply and demand is the basis of every free trade and economic practice. The suppliers are only willing to produce (products, commodities, or services) in quantities that accommodate consumer’s demands. In the absence of one of these two poles, there will seize to be any form of trade within this business market. In other words, the consumer demand for products is what encourages suppliers to produce a specific quantity of products (Norum and Cuno, 2011). Conversely, when a supplier offers a product that satisfies the consumer’s needs, the products will attract consumer’s intentions to invest in the product within the market. This law of supply and demand also plays a significant role in the case of counterfeit products (Lee and Yoo, 2009).

Consumer demand and the transaction of counterfeit products across an array of markets encourage counterfeiters to produce and sell more counterfeit products. Besides, it will also increase the counterfeiter’s potency that leads them to infiltrate various markets across different industries.
The Factors Affecting Non-Deceptive Consumer’s Intentions towards Counterfeit Products in Different Regions and across Sectors

There are many reasons behind the consumer’s demand and purchase of counterfeit products (Non-Deceptive). Counterfeiters make ethical justifications for themselves and rationalize their behavior in terms of being accommodating to individuals who have a lower-income or for markets where genuine products cannot be found. In this instance, previous studies (theoretical and empirical) have investigated reasons as to why consumers demand and make purchases from both this illegal and unethical trade. These previous studies were conducted in different regions and across different sectors to detect the factors that significantly influence consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products.

RESEARCH METHOD

Sampling Method

This chapter is based on the findings of multiple studies. This study is a review based on the finding of previous studies to understand the factors affecting Non-deceptive consumers of counterfeited products in different regions across sectors. The researcher essentially utilized various search engines (online databases), such as Google Scholar, Business Source, and Science Director as means to collect studies related to non-deceptive consumers and counterfeit products. To have a good result in searching for previous studies, the researcher was trying to find the articles through specific keywords as counterfeit products, Non-deceptive consumers, consumer behavior, counterfeit in markets, consumer demands, consumer’s intentions, consumer awareness, and purchase experience. After collecting the previous studies and to aid comprehension and understanding of the significance of these studies, each study had its findings paired with it and was organized in the form of a table (Appendix A). Essentially, the aim is to derive the factors which affect non-deceptive consumer behavior in different regions and across various sectors.

Data Collection Method

The researcher collected the previous studies and organized them into a table (Appendix A) which includes 26 studies about factors that positively and negatively influenced consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products. The researcher categorized them based on the research methodologies they used, as well as including the site of each study conducted and which counterfeited product sector it applies to, and finally the result of each investigation achieved.

By classifying and categorizing these previous studies in the form of a table (Appendix A), the researcher has consequently made things easier to understand in regards to where, when, and how they were conducted as well as findings and the results of each study.

Data Analysis

This review of previous studies provides many insights in regard to non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products to which researcher have concluded that:

- There are two primary differences between the studies collected; the first one in the region where the studies were conducted because consumer’s attitudes, subjective norms, and brand consciousness differ from one country to another (Chiu and Leng 2016; Eisend and Schuchert-Güler, 2006). The second is the study of the sectors which are subjected to counterfeited products. Consumer’s intentions to purchase counterfeit products can differ across sectors and products categories (Eisend and Schuchert-Güler, 2006; Hamelin, Nwankwo and El Hadouchi, 2012; Penz and Stottinger, 2004; Phau, Prendergast and Chuen, 2002; Tom, Garibaldi, Zeng and Pilcher 1998; Wee, Ta and Cheok 1995).

- Six studies (23 percent) based on the theory of reasoned action (TRA) and the Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB) (Ajzen and Fishbein, 1980). TRA theory explains the relationship between attitudes and behaviors within humans to predict and understand how an individual will perform and make decisions built on his/her attitudes and behavioral purposes. However, TPB later links individual beliefs and behavior together. The only difference between TPB and TRA is that TPB includes behavioral control as an additional determinant of intentions and behavior.

Based on TRA and TPB, scholars studied the purchase intention of consumers towards counterfeit products. They tested the variables
mentioned in these theories as well as the impact on consumer’s intentions especially non-deceptive consumers towards counterfeiting products.

- There were many different counterfeit products investigated in these studies such as mobile handsets, counterfeit sporting goods, fashion and electronics, shoes and movie DVDs, cosmetics, leather goods, and car parts.

- The collected studies are mostly conducted in Asia and America. The majority of studies followed the quantitative and qualitative research methods. While the minorities of them were based on both the mixed-method and descriptive research method.

- These previous studies focus on different variables that influence consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products. There is not a single list of variables that affect consumer’s intentions when we have different regions and different product sectors. However, the researcher can identify an array of common variables that influence consumer’s decisions which is a recurrent theme in many studies. These variables affect consumer’s intentions in various product categories and different regions.

- The majority of non-deceptive consumer’s intentions are towards counterfeit products that do not pose a risk to one’s health.

The common recurrent variables across different studies mean that they have a significant influence on consumer’s intentions toward counterfeit products regardless of the type of product, the region, or the participant’s culture in which the study was conducted. Most of the researchers in these studies tested the influence and correlations of the factors (variables) which impact the consumer’s intentions and decisions of purchasing counterfeit products. The common elements across these studies helped the researcher identify the most dominant factors which influence non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products. The researcher can consider these dominant variables as the most influencing set of variables on non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products.

It is of utmost importance to further understand the relationship between non-deceptive consumer and counterfeit products when we go deeper into understanding these dominant and common factors in the previous studies. Figure 1 includes these factors that consist of person demographic and psychographic, lack of consumer awareness, market influence, social influence, word of mouth, perceived risks, materialism and brand, ethics, key product factors, price-consciousness, and past purchase experience.

**DISCUSSION**

**Consumers Intentions during Purchasing Process**

In the literature part, we found the factors that impact on Non-Deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products. Regardless of whether the consumer decides to invest in the product or not, there is a range of common dominant factors that affect the consumer’s intention and behavior towards purchasing a counterfeit product. Consumer’s behaviors (attitude, subjective norm, and perceived behavioral control) relate to the individual’s purchasing activities, what they purchased, where they prefer to purchase their products, and the decision in regard to the purchase. It is all about the consumer’s intention regarding buying certain products. Consumer’s intention is related to consumer’s attitudes, subjective norms, and perceived behavioral control.

**Analysis of the Factors Impacts on Non-Deceptive Consumers Intentions towards Counterfeit Products**

In the previous chapter, we concluded from previous research the factors affecting Non-deceptive consumers of counterfeited products in different regions across sectors. In this part we are going to deeply understand each factor obtained and analyze its impacts on enhancing non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products:

**Person Demographic and Psychographic**

Demographic information is statistical data which includes gender, age, income, and marital status. Person psychographic is related to values, personality, lifestyle, opinions, and interests. Many studies have concluded that the significance of person demographic and psychographic towards consumer’s intention of purchasing counterfeit products exists across different product categories. (Eisend, Hartmann
Figure 1: Framework summarizes the factors affecting non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products across sectors (Source: Work of Author).

and Apaolaza, 2017; Kala and Chaubey, 2017).

**Lack of Consumer Awareness**

When consumers are attracted to a brand, especially the luxury and expensive one, they develop a passion for owning such a brand. This enthusiasm towards luxury brands will encourage their intention to buy the counterfeit one. The lack of knowledge in regard to the negative impact of counterfeit products will contribute to this problem (Sari, Soediro and Rochman, 2018).

**Market Influence**

In general, every country has a governmental entity that implements laws to protect the intellectual property of brands. However, not all countries adequately apply the law as a mean to protect the owner’s rights. The enforceability of various laws to protect intellectual property and the brands (governments’ commitment) differ from country to another.

There are various factors that aid organizations in expanding their markets (whether they are domestic to international) through distributing their products all over the world. Nowadays these include imports and exports, advertising, and consumer demand which bring markets into greater proximity. There is in fact a clear similarity between markets and consumer demands in different regions. As a result of the increased level of globalization, this has led to heightened levels of integration, interaction, and cooperation. The huge effects of globalization on business and marketing strategies cannot be reversed nor negated.

**Social Influence**

Social influence consists of conformity, socialization, peer pressure, obedience, leadership, persuasion, sales, and marketing. These factors contribute to changes in personal behavior. Essentially, consumers are generally affected by their social circumstances therefore what potentially increases this sense of societal pressure is whether this consumer chooses to invest in these counterfeited products. This desire to invest in a luxury product motivates consumers to buy the counterfeit alternative when the
original product is too expensive, particularly for consumers with low income but also intend to protect their social standing (Phau and Teah, 2009).

Word of Mouth
Counterfeiters do not use public media outlets to advertise the illicit trade of these products. They sell counterfeit products in an undercover manner. Counterfeiters in developing countries use websites to promote their counterfeit products (Mir, 2013).

However, they depend a lot on word of mouth which is a strong communication tool (Wee et al., 1995).

- **Perceived Risks**
  Perceived risks impact consumer’s attitudes towards their intention of purchasing counterfeit products. When perceived risks increase, the probability that consumers purchase the counterfeit product will by default decrease (Albers-Miller 1999; Bauer, 1960; Hanzae and Taghipourian, 2012; Khalid and Rahman, 2015).

- **Materialism and Brand**
  Both materialism and brand potency influence consumer’s decisions when purchasing counterfeit brands as this is related directly to improving their social positioning within their communities. On the contrary, an un-materialistic individual pays little attention to luxury brands (Davidson, Nepomuceno and Laroche, 2017; Sharma and Chan, 2011).

- **Ethics**
  There are ethical aspects related to consumer’s sentiments towards counterfeiting products, and this includes religiosity, ethical concern, and perception of unlawfulness which directly and indirectly affect consumer’s behavioral intention to purchase counterfeit products (Norum and Cuno, 2011; Quoquab et al., 2017).

- **Key Products Factors**
  Physical appearance, durability, and quality are the key product factors that consumers are looking for while purchasing products. If a counterfeit product’s appearance and quality are close to the authentic version, then it will increase the consumer’s intentions in buying it. Product attribute is significantly related to counterfeit products (Cordell, Wongtada and Kieschnick, 1996; Phau and Teah, 2009).

- **Price-Consciousness**
  Researchers who have previously studied concerning this topic argued that the price point is one of the strongest influences on consumer’s attitudes and intentions in buying counterfeit products (Albers-Miller, 1999; Cordell et al., 1996, Faruqui, Hoque and Hride, 2017; Mir, 2013).

- **Past Purchase Experience**
  Consumer’s previous experience with counterfeit products enhances their attitude towards their purchase; they have the knowledge to invest counterfeit products which satisfy their demands (Tom et al., 1998).

CONCLUSION
This study sheds light on a multitude of previous studies to create a better understanding of the relationship between non-deceptive consumer and counterfeit products in the market. The primary motive behind this study was to investigate and test the factors that influence non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products. These factors encourage non-deceptive consumers to demand and purchase counterfeit products. It occurred to the researcher that some of these factors are both dominant and recurrent in many studies, whether in different product categories or different regions. Based on these factors which are included in many studies, the researcher can conclude that they are the significant factors that influence consumer’s intentions regardless of the type of counterfeit products, region, and culture of the non-deceptive consumers. The researcher found that the consumer’s attitude is the strongest predictor that influences consumers in many industries and many different cultures. Moreover, other factors such as personal demographic and psychographic, lack of consumer awareness, market influence, social influence, word of mouth, perceived risks, materialism and brand, ethics, key product factors, price-consciousness, and past purchase experience, influence consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products in the case of non-deceptive consumers.
Managerial and Organizational Implications

The organization's role and priority are to essentially protect their business from external threats such as counterfeiting. Consumer's demand for counterfeit products is the most dominant factor in regard to the illegal trade of these products within such markets. Managers should study every factor which increases non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products, in order to further understand why consumers sometimes prefer to purchase counterfeit products instead of authentic products. By analyzing these factors, managers begin making managerial decisions to implement strategies that combat counterfeiting crime to secure their business.

Combating this crime should start by focusing on the non-deceptive consumers in these markets and making them aware of counterfeit products which will in turn hypothetically increase their loyalty towards authentic brands. Also, by directing consumers to the suitable products that meet their requirements and satisfying them in a way that makes them loyal in their choices to genuine products. Decreasing non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products will protect them from being prone to the low-quality of counterfeit products and losing their money and in some cases, to protect their health.

When non-deceptive consumer’s intentions and purchasing of counterfeit products decrease the illegal trade of counterfeiting products will also decrease in size. As mentioned before, the power and the distribution channel of counterfeiters in markets increase due to the consumer’s demand for counterfeit products. The greatest implication is the greed of the counterfeiters which leads them to deceive consumers and sell potentially toxic products. Separate the non-deceptive consumers from deceptive consumers cannot be divided in this illegal trade, both are the main rationale for counterfeiters to expand businesses.

Therefore, as a result of increased consumer demand, it consequently has a knock-on effect on the productivity of counterfeiters who are then encouraged to further deceive consumers in other markets and other products to increase their profit margins.

The managing team must work on increasing their consumer’s loyalty towards their genuine products, develop strategies to protect their markets, and increase the exertion of their efforts to combat this crime. These steps must be taken to encourage consumer awareness to refrain from purchasing and using these products regardless of whether they are deceptive consumers or non-deceptive consumers.

- Person demographic and psychographic impacts on non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products. It is of utmost importance that organizations should observe and understand their consumer’s attitudes and behaviors in the market which they serve. In this way organizations, will know more about their consumer's behavior in the purchasing process.

Social influence impacts non-deceptive consumers, as we concluded (from many previous studies collected in the literature part) it is mostly non-deceptive consumers who attracted to luxury counterfeit products as a mean to improve their social positioning. In regard to this point, companies should invest in a second line of products that could be affordable to consumers (especially lower-income consumers) to help them improve their social positioning. This also suggests that price consciousness factor is a dominant factor which impacts on non-deceptive consumer intention to purchase counterfeit products. Especially on consumers with a lower-income and who are looking to purchase luxury products. Based on the impact of price consciousness factor, companies should produce and launch new products with unique specifications and lower price points for them to be affordable for lower-income individuals. The price point is what essentially attracts consumers towards counterfeit products in the case of non-deceptive consumers. In other words, they can open outlets branches to target lower-income markets. This will help lower-income consumers buy the authentic brand with prices that they can afford (Sharma and Chan, 2011).

- In the case of non-deceptive consumer ethics and perceived risk impacts on consumer decision whether to purchase the counterfeit products or not. Non-deceptive consumers should be informed of the risk of purchasing the counterfeit product to decrease their intentions in buying it. Organizations should regularly help
consumers to be aware of counterfeit products through advertising about the risks of using counterfeit products. Inform them about the huge negative impacts of counterfeiting products on their health and losing money. Moreover, to always remind consumers of the ethical trade involved in purchasing genuine products.

- In the case of non-deceptive consumers, key product factors are made clear to them. In general, they can differentiate between genuine and counterfeit products. Businesses should manufacture products under high-quality standards. By differentiating their products through increased efforts in the field of research and development departments will make things more complex on counterfeiters to copy it.

Lack of consumer awareness increases their probability of being prone to counterfeit. Organizations should be establishing effective customer relationship management to increase consumer’s loyalty and to inform them about the brand of the company. Customer relationship management is a tool that helps organizations to easily contact and manage every interaction with consumers to increase the efficiency of the sales and marketing team. This also will help organizations to detect external threats that attack their brand and consumers in markets as counterfeiting.

- Markets have become very similar to each other which have resulted in companies having the advantage to distribute their products in many domestic markets due to the feasibility of distribution channels and orders delivery. This is primarily due to having many platforms that change the traditional trade and lead to an increase in online selling. So organizations should increase their efforts in regards to having authentic online sites as well as increased advertisements for their e-commerce and their genuine products. Nowadays, e-commerce contributes to the counterfeit trade. It connects the counterfeiters directly to consumers outside the legal distribution channel and away from governmental agencies. When organizations inform consumers about their legitimate online sites, they will be aware of them not to be prone to illegal and counterfeited e-commerce. Besides, companies should advertise the locations of authentic shops. If the company has a wide distribution channel, like mass production, they should increase their efforts through auditors to make inspections in these shops to detect whether they sell counterfeit products or not.

- Word of Mouth impacts on consumers; they are influenced by their friends and families regarding the purchasing of goods in markets. In this context, organizations should offer awards to anyone who can help them in giving information about counterfeiters and illegal shops that sell counterfeit products of the organization brand and those attack its Intellectual Property. Besides, organizations should increase their role in monitoring the market and take action by pursuing counterfeiters legally through law enforcement and prosecution of perpetrators. Organizations should have a good link with consumers in markets, they can benefit from this link with consumers to support their missions in combating counterfeit products. This could be done by increasing the consumer consciousness of counterfeit products. In this way, companies could benefit from word of mouth consciousness of counterfeit products. In this way, companies could benefit from word of mouth factors between consumers to spot on the negative impacts of counterfeit products.

- Materialism and Brand impacts on consumers who were interested in buying a product with high materialism and belong to a successful brand. Organizations should increase their distribution channel. Authentic products should be available within many markets, even in rural markets where they are not traditionally found. Consequently, consumers who look to have a product manufactured with high material quality and belong to a successful brand will be aware of the differences between the genuine products sold by owners of the brand which are controlled within a secure supply chain, and the counterfeit products that sold in markets out of these authentic branches. Lack of availability of genuine products increases the opportunity to deceive consumers and the foundation of counterfeit products in markets (Pujara and Chaurasia, 2012).

- Organizations should reinforce consumer’s experience of choosing the genuine products that should satisfy their needs. They should encourage consumers to purchase experience through advertising or seminars. Consumer past purchase experience is a very important factor that helps consumers be aware of purchasing counterfeit products.
Aforementioned points are suggestions that could be followed by managers to protect their consumers from counterfeit products. We concluded these managerial suggestions based on the factors obtained in the result of this study and its impacts on consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products.

Limitations and Future Research

Limitations of the Study

The researcher collected an array of previous studies about various counterfeit product sectors in a different region. The researcher could not find many studies about the factors that enhance non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products of the same sectors. In other words, the researcher could not find different previous studies about the factors that encourage non-deceptive consumers towards the same product in different regions to compare it with each other.

Future Research

The researcher concluded the common dominant factors that impact on non-deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products in different sectors and regions were cultivated. These common dominant factors could be tested on non-deceptive consumers of any counterfeited products and in any region to check its significance on non-deceptive consumer’s decisions towards counterfeit products.

REFERENCE


Moustafa Al Atat


Appendix A: Previous studies of the factors influence Non-Deceptive consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Journal/Year</th>
<th>Type of Study</th>
<th>Research Methodology/Analysis</th>
<th>Data Collection Methods/Sampling</th>
<th>Study Context</th>
<th>Theory</th>
<th>Sites</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Miz.</td>
<td>Journal of Business Economics and Management (2013).</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Exploratory Factory Analysis (EFA), multiple regression analysis.</td>
<td>Single case study/Random sample (Lottery system).</td>
<td>Non-Deceptive Counterfeiting, South Asia (Mobile handsets)</td>
<td>Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) (Fishbein, Ajzen 1975).</td>
<td>Students at Iqra University Islamabad (Pakistan)</td>
<td>1:170 samples to assess the validity and reliability. Phase 2: questionnaire analysis 400 questionnaires.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Journal</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Analytical Methods</td>
<td>Research Questions/Findings</td>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quooha, Pahlawan, Mohammad, &amp; Ramayyah</td>
<td>Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Single case study (non-probability sampling)</td>
<td>Analysis through SPSS and SmartPLS3.</td>
<td>Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB) (Ajzen and Fishbein, 1980).</td>
<td>In Chinatown 400 survey, Low Yat Plaza, as well as few “Pasar Malam” (night markets). Attitude is positively related to the intention to purchase counterfeit products. Religiosity, ethical perceptions towards lawfulness are the attitude predictors and negatively related to it.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Davidson, Negombe, &amp; Laroche</td>
<td>Springer Science Business Media Dordrecht</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Multi-case Random samples</td>
<td>Regression analysis.</td>
<td>Materialism leads to purchase intention of counterfeit products. Conceptual framework, based on previous studies, generates and test hypothesis.</td>
<td>3 studies; study 1: 187 survey from North American participants through Amazon’s Mechanical Turk, study 2: sample of 120 participants from North America, study 3: random sample. Materialism impacts on consumers purchase intention towards counterfeit products. Materialistic individuals are less likely to demand to counterfeit products.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Journal Title</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Sample Type</td>
<td>Hypothesis</td>
<td>Data Collection</td>
<td>Findings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joji, Joseph</td>
<td>Vilakshun, XIMB Journal of Management (2013)</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>Counterfeit shoes and pirated movie DVDs.</td>
<td>Testing the model of Michaelidou and Christodoulides (2011).</td>
<td>300 participants, non-deceptive counterfeiting, from Ernakulam, Kerala. Negative impacts of Price Consciousness and Perceived Risk on consumer attitude towards counterfeit shoes and DVD. The ethical obligations do not directly impact on consumer intentions towards counterfeit shoes and DVD, but moderate low ethical obligation (EO) negatively affect on positive attitude towards counterfeit shoes and DVD.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Swarni, Charnor-Prematic, Farrhand | The Journal of Socio-Economics (2009) | Quantitative | Regression analysis and structural equation modeling | 19 types of counterfeit goods. | Conceptual framework, based on previous studies, generates and test hypothesis. | 237 participants (British adults). Age positively impacts on Material happiness, Material centrality, Law and order, and Conscientious. However, it’s negatively affecting the experience.  
  - Experience of purchasing counterfeit products significantly and positively affect the willingness to buy counterfeit Goods (WBG).  
  - Material centrality was positively associated with WBG and negatively associated with the law and order subscale of the attitudes towards counterfeiting scale.  
  - Material happiness negatively predicted WBG and positively predicted law and order attitudes towards counterfeiting.  
  - Those that care about law and order are less willing to buy counterfeit products.  
  - Law and order is the powerful predictor of WBG. |
Moustafa Al Atat

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Conceptual Framework</th>
<th>Location/ Sample Size</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bian, Moustinho</td>
<td>European Journal of Marketing (2011)</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Principal Component Analysis (PCA) and Principle Factor Analysis (PFA) to test the conceptual model and hypothesis.</td>
<td>Conceptual framework, based on previous studies, generates and test hypothesis.</td>
<td>Glasgow, UK; 321 Rolex Watches consumers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A functional product attribute is a predictor of the purchase intention of counterfeit Rolex. Consumer's satisfaction towards counterfeit Rolex increases with purchasing. Consumer's perceived brand image of counterfeit branded products (CBPs) does not vary significantly with different levels of product involvement. Product involvement has no significant effect on consumer purchase intention of CBPs. Product knowledge is negatively associated with the consumer's perceptions of the product attribute. Product knowledge would be negatively related to consumer purchase tendency of a CBP.

Social motivation, personal gratification, perception, value, brand loyalty, and ethics are the variables that impact on consumer's intentions towards counterfeit products. However, the 'influence of society' and 'value for money' are the strongest factors that impact consumer's decisions towards counterfeit products.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Research Design</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
<th>Sample Composition</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sharma, Char</td>
<td>Journal of Marketing Management (2011)</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Exploratory factor analysis and item to total correlation analysis</td>
<td>Random sample</td>
<td>Many kinds of counterfeit products.</td>
<td>Conceptualizing counterfeit prominence based on previous studies.</td>
<td>340 participants shoppers at a local shopping mall in Hong Kong.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Brand consciousness and materialistic increase consumer's intentions toward counterfeit products to save their social status. Younger consumers and those with lower education and income levels are likely to be more counterfeit prone. Older, better-educated, and higher-income consumers to be more materialistic and face consciously. Moreover, females were also found to be more materialistic and face consciously, whereas males were more likely to indulge in status consumption.

Functions served by attitudes toward one, an object can influence consumer's preferences for other objects. Consumption context is determined not just by the consumer or the product category but also by more understated of the importance of the marketing mix.

Consumer's attitudes are an important factor affecting the purchase. Change in consumer's attitudes may be of greater importance in determining the demand for counterfeit goods than an increase in consumer awareness or education about the problem.

Price consciousness, lower price and consumer past satisfaction experience with counterfeit products encourage them to purchase counterfeit products.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Research Design</th>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kwong, Yan, Lee, Sin, &amp; Tse</td>
<td>Journal of Business Ethics</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Principal Component Analysis (PCA)</td>
<td>Survey, 306 consumers from Hong Kong</td>
<td>CDs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nguyen &amp; Tran</td>
<td>Business Management Dynamics</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Exploratory factor analysis (EFA) to test for constructs</td>
<td>Survey, 300 participants</td>
<td>Fashion counterfeit products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pujara, &amp; Chaurasia</td>
<td>The IUP Journal of Marketing Management</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>Quantitative</td>
<td>Descriptive and t-test analysis</td>
<td>Pirated CD/DVD and pirated clothing</td>
<td>India students and non-students’ participants N=232, 111 participants in questionnaires about pirated CD/DVD and 121 questionnaires in pirated clothing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Journal/Title</td>
<td>Methodological Approach</td>
<td>Case Study/Methodology</td>
<td>Conceptual Framework/Research</td>
<td>Participants/Geography</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sari, Soedion, Rochman</td>
<td>JEMA: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Akuntansi dan Manajemen (2018)</td>
<td>Qualitative Phenomenological Research</td>
<td>Case study/Interviews/sampling with snowball sampling method</td>
<td>Conceptual framework, based on previous studies, generates and test hypothesis.</td>
<td>6 participants from Malang.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agarwal, &amp; Panwar</td>
<td>The IUP Journal of Brand Management (2016)</td>
<td>Qualitative Sample consumers experience with knockoffs.</td>
<td>In depth interviews</td>
<td>Conceptual framework, based on previous studies, generates and test hypothesis.</td>
<td>25 participants from various cities of Rajasthan.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tang, Tian, Zaichkowski</td>
<td>Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics (2014)</td>
<td>Qualitative Exploratory study (triangulation approach)</td>
<td>Focus Group Unknown</td>
<td>Grounded theory.</td>
<td>13 focus group, 95 informants from university in Hong Kong.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Consumers are attracted to POND’S products by the marketing stimuli, including promotion, products, and prices.

- Social factors (reference groups) and psychological factors (motivation and belief).
- The positive reputation of the brand makes consumers think that its counterfeit versions are as good as the originals.
- Lack of socialization of appeals and warnings from National Agency of Drug and Food Control (BPOM) and related agencies fail to prevent some of the informants from using counterfeit POND’S products.

Buying a counterfeit may be a value-driven decision for some. Buying a counterfeit fashion product was an exciting deal, while for some it was a substandard practice.

Factors influence consumer’s intentions towards counterfeit products are: Utility (35.2 percent), risk perception (22.0 percent), social influence (12.6 percent), confusion (9.6 percent), ethical perception (8.6 percent), habit (1.8 percent), desire for exploration (1.4 percent), local interest (5.3 percent), and cultural influence (3.5 percent).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Data Source</th>
<th>Research Design</th>
<th>Theory</th>
<th>Cases Published by the Counterfeit Intelligence Bureau (CIB)</th>
<th>Four Strategies that Counterfeiters Follow in Their Business are:</th>
<th>Context</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stevenson &amp; Bushy</td>
<td>International Journal of Operations &amp; Production Management (2015)</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Inductive, qualitative analysis of secondary case data.</td>
<td>Secondary data from 3 sources.</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Grounded theory</td>
<td>Four strategies: Extraction Strategies; Production Strategies; Distribution Strategies; Infiltration Strategies</td>
<td>When consumers of the original brand notice that this brand is subjected to counterfeit then they will turn to one of these strategies: flight (abandoning the brand), reclamation (olaborating the pioneering brand of a brand), and switching (disguising all brand cases).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaubry &amp; Stumpf</td>
<td>Journal of Consumer Marketing (2011)</td>
<td>Descriptive</td>
<td>Statistical and Numerical Analysis.</td>
<td>Web based survey.</td>
<td>Movies and pharmaceuticals counterfeit products.</td>
<td>Collecting data from previous research.</td>
<td>Many factors behind consumer complicity towards counterfeit products: desirability of product attributes; ease of obtaining the counterfeit; misfortune of having low income or limited education; view that being complicit is acceptable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cheung, &amp; Prendergast</td>
<td>Journal of International Consumer Marketing (2006)</td>
<td>Mixed method</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pirated VCDs and pirated clothing and accessories.</td>
<td>Focus group, 8 participants in Hong Kong and 8 participants in Shanghai. Survey 700 participants in Hong Kong and Shanghai consumers.</td>
<td>Price and buying location mainly the strongest identifier of counterfeit products.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Many factors enhance counterfeiters to continue their illegal business instead of leaving their brands. The factors are additional marketing spending associated with branding, lack of knowledge on how to create brands, perception of weak demand for domestic brands, perceived risk of branding, fear of competition as a brand and absence of incentive of additional profitability.

Source: Work of researcher according to data collected from previous studies.